

## Cumulative effects of multiple stressors: An invasive oyster and nutrient enrichment reduce subsequent invasive barnacle recruitment

Vye, Siobhan R.; Emmerson, Mark C.; Dick, Jaimie T. A.; O'Connor, Nessa E.

**Journal of Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology**

DOI:

[10.1016/j.jembe.2016.10.021](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jembe.2016.10.021)

Published: 01/01/2017

Peer reviewed version

[Cyswllt i'r cyhoeddiad / Link to publication](#)

*Dyfyniad o'r fersiwn a gyhoeddwyd / Citation for published version (APA):*

Vye, S. R., Emmerson, M. C., Dick, J. T. A., & O'Connor, N. E. (2017). Cumulative effects of multiple stressors: An invasive oyster and nutrient enrichment reduce subsequent invasive barnacle recruitment. *Journal of Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology*, 486, 322-327. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jembe.2016.10.021>

### Hawliau Cyffredinol / General rights

Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

- Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.
- You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
- You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal ?

### Take down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

**Title:** Cumulative effects of multiple stressors: an invasive oyster and nutrient enrichment  
reduce subsequent invasive barnacle recruitment

**Authors:** Siobhan R. Vye<sup>1, 2, 3</sup>, Mark C. Emmerson<sup>1, 2, 4</sup>, Jaimie T.A. Dick<sup>1, 2, 4</sup>, Nessa E.  
O'Connor<sup>1, 2, 4</sup>

<sup>1</sup> School of Biological Sciences, Medical Biology Centre, Queen's University Belfast, 97  
Lisburn Road, Belfast, BT9 7BL, UK

<sup>2</sup> Queen's University Marine Laboratory, 12-13 The Strand, Portaferry, Co. Down, Northern  
Ireland, BT22 1PF, UK.

<sup>3</sup> Present address: School of Ocean Sciences, Bangor University, Menai Bridge, Anglesey,  
LL59 5AB, UK

<sup>4</sup> Institute for Global Food Security, Queen's University Belfast, 18-30 Malone Road, Belfast,  
BT9 5BN, UK.

Corresponding author: Siobhan R. Vye, Email: [s.vye@bangor.ac.uk](mailto:s.vye@bangor.ac.uk),

Key words: multiple stressors, *Crassostrea gigas*, *Austrominius modestus*, early life history  
processes, benthic

## 16   **Abstract**

17   Studies identifying interactions between biological invasions and other stressors have  
18   generally focussed on quantifying their cumulative effects on mature species assemblages. In  
19   benthic systems, however, early life history processes are key determinants of assemblage  
20   structure and functioning. This study tested whether the presence of an invasive species  
21   affected early life history processes of two common barnacle species and whether this was  
22   affected by a second common stressor, nutrient enrichment. The results of a field experiment  
23   identified and characterised the effects of an invasive oyster, *Crassostrea gigas*, on the early  
24   life history processes of the two barnacle species under ambient and enriched nutrient  
25   conditions. In the presence *C. gigas*, the invasive barnacle *Austrominius modestus*, had a  
26   lower recruitment rate, however, there was no effect of the presence of *C. gigas* on native  
27   barnacle, *Semibalanus balanoides*, recruitment. Nutrient enrichment also reduced the  
28   recruitment rate of *A. modestus*, however, there was no evidence of synergistic or  
29   antagonistic interactions between these stressors, indicating their cumulative effects were  
30   additive. There was no effect of nutrient enrichment on native barnacle recruitment. Our  
31   results show that the presence of an invasive oyster and nutrient enrichment altered the  
32   recruitment of another non-native benthic species. These findings emphasise the importance  
33   of considering early life history processes when assessing effects of multiple stressors on  
34   communities.

## 1. Introduction

Identifying and quantifying the impacts of multiple anthropogenic stressors, such as invasive species and nutrient enrichment, is a research priority in order to understand and predict potential detrimental effects on ecosystems (Crain et al., 2008; Sutherland et al., 2009; Strayer, 2012). Interactions between invasive species and other anthropogenic stressors can lead to cumulative effects that are additive or are greater than (synergistic) or less than (antagonistic) the sum of the individual effects (Folt et al., 1999; Crain et al., 2008). Synergistic cumulative effects on communities are thought to be the most common (Sala and Knowlton, 2006) and their occurrence has been supported by several empirical studies. For example, Piazzini et al. (2005) showed a decline in percentage cover of erect algal species when exposed to the invasive green algae *Caulerpa racemosa* var. *cylindracea* in increased sedimentation regimes. Conversely, antagonistic interactions have also been identified, such as the ability of the invasive freshwater zebra mussel, *Dreissena polymorpha*, to negate the effects of nutrient enrichment on algal biomass (Dzialowski and Jessie, 2009), and the presence of *Sargassum muticum*, an invasive fucoid algae, mediating the effects of nutrient enrichment and warming on algal biomass (Vye et al., 2015).

To date, studies have focussed on the context-dependent impacts of biological invasions on the diversity and functioning of mature communities (e.g. Queiros et al., 2011; Green and Crowe, 2014). In benthic ecosystems, the structure and functioning of a mature community can be determined by early life history processes, such as larval settlement and post-settlement mortality (Connell, 1985; Gaines and Roughgarden, 1985; Hunt and Scheibling, 1997; Aguilera and Navarrete, 2012). Settlement, defined as the permanent attachment of larvae to the substratum (Connell, 1985), is often determined by larval supply and a range of settlement cues that indicate habitat suitability and resource availability, such as the presence of free space and biofilm abundance (Strathmann et al., 1981; Rodriguez et al., 1993). Early

post-settlement mortality may be driven by predation, disturbance or physiological stress (Menge and Sutherland, 1987). Both settlement and early post-settlement mortality can constrain recruitment into the adult population and, therefore, are important components of benthic species population dynamics (Gosselin and Qian, 1997; Delany et al., 2003; Jenkins, 2005). The relative importance of these early life history processes in structuring communities can be context specific. Early post-settlement mortality is generally more important in determining population structure in species with high recruitment rates, such as barnacles (Connell, 1961a; Gosselin and Qian, 1996), whereas populations of species with a lower larval supply, such as some species of corals (Hughes et al., 2000), crustaceans (Wahle and Incze, 1997) and echinoderms (Balch and Scheibling, 2000), are more likely to be affected by differences in settlement rates (Connell, 1961a). Invasive species, in combination with other stressors, such as nutrient enrichment or warming, may drive changes in settlement and post-settlement mortality by altering physical conditions, such as substratum type and hydrological regimes, and biological interactions, such as competition and predation (Gutierrez et al., 2003; Wilkie et al., 2013).

In coastal ecosystems, bivalve molluscs are common invasive species. Outside of its native range, the Pacific oyster, *Crassostrea gigas*, has wide-ranging and context-dependent effects on recipient communities, including driving shifts in native species assemblage structures (Kochmann et al., 2008), differences in ecosystem functioning rates (Green et al., 2012), and the co-introduction and facilitation of other invaders (Ruesink et al., 2005). Often the impacts of *C. gigas* increase in intensity as invasion progresses and the density of the oysters increases (Yokomizo et al., 2009; Green and Crowe, 2013). Although the impacts of *C. gigas* on mature communities are well documented (e.g., Padilla, 2010), little is known about the potential interactions between *C. gigas* and native or invasive species at early life history stages (Wilkie et al., 2012).

*C. gigas* forms feral populations in inlets and estuaries, where eutrophication is a common co-occurring stressor that can affect the impacts of biological invasions on recipient communities (Lotze et al., 2006; Gennaro and Piazzzi, 2011; Vaz-Pinto et al., 2013). Thus, testing whether the presence and density of *C. gigas* interacts with nutrient enrichment to affect settlement and recruitment processes is a realistic scenario from which to identify the context-dependent effects of invasive species. A field experiment was designed to test for the separate and cumulative effects of the presence of *C. gigas* and nutrient enrichment on benthic species settlement and recruitment rates. Specifically, the hypothesis tested were: (1) the presence of invasive *C. gigas* and nutrient enrichment will affect the identity and abundance of other benthic species settlers and recruits; (2) these putative effects will interact, such that the effect of the presence of the invasive oyster on other benthic species settlement and recruitment will differ between ambient and enriched nutrient conditions; (3) the cumulative effects of the presence of the invasive oyster and nutrient enrichment on other benthic species will be determined by oyster density.

## **2. Material and methods**

### *2.1. Study site*

The field experiment ran from February through to August 2013 at Ballygreen, a sheltered intertidal sedimentary shore on the south western shore of Lough Swilly, Co. Donegal, Ireland (55° 2' 31.54" N, 7° 33' 36.06" W). At this site, boulders are common and scattered on sediment comprised of sandy mud, pebbles and shell fragments. Tides are semi-diurnal and have a maximal range of approximately 4.5 m. The study was conducted at mid shore where boulders were colonised primarily by the native barnacle *Semibalanus balanoides* and the non-native barnacle *Austrominius modestus* (formerly *Elminius modestus*), the fucoid algae *Fucus vesiculosus*, the honeycomb worm *Sabellaria alveolata* and the keel worm,

*Pomatoceros triqueter*. *Austrominius modestus* has spread rapidly since its introduction to the UK and Ireland in the 1940s and may compete with native barnacle species (Bishop, 1947; Crisp, 1958; Lawson et al., 2004). Lough Swilly is a relatively unpolluted estuary compared to other more densely populated coastal areas of Ireland that have been classified as eutrophic in assessments of water quality (Bradley et al., 2015).

## 2.2. Experimental design and set up

To quantify benthic species recruitment under manipulated conditions, forty grey opaque Perspex® settlement plates (210 mm x 148 mm x 5 mm) were attached to the side of boulders (one per boulder), which had been selected randomly along approximately 40 m x 10 m of mid shore dominated by barnacles and *Fucus vesiculosus*. Grey Perspex® was chosen to represent natural conditions based on the colour of the bedrock to minimise any differences in thermal regime between the settlement plates and boulders (Lathlean and Minchinton, 2012). Each plate was sanded for thirty seconds using coarse sand paper to ensure suitable rugosity for settlement (Jara et al., 2006). Plates were attached to boulders at least two metres apart using stainless steel screws (Stachowicz et al., 2002; Canning-Clode et al., 2008).

An orthogonal experimental design included two fixed factors: (i) presence of the invasive *C. gigas* at four levels: absent, 1 individual (ind.) per plate, 4 ind. or 8 ind. (equivalent to approximately 0, 32, 129, and 515 individuals per m<sup>2</sup>); and (ii) nutrient enrichment at two levels: ambient conditions and nutrient enriched. Each treatment was replicated five times, yielding 40 experimental units. Settlement plates were allocated randomly to treatments. Non-reproductive triploid oysters (Guo and Allen, 1994) from a local aquaculture facility were used to minimise effects on the feral oyster population. Juvenile oysters (spat) were used in the experiment and were six months old and  $36 \pm 0.5$  mm in length, similar to the age and size of naturally settled spat at the time the experiment commenced. Spat were attached

to the front surface of the settlement plates using Milliput<sup>®</sup> epoxy putty (Dolgellau, Wales). Previous work showed that there were no differences in assemblages associated with *C. gigas* attached using this method compared to those with *C. gigas* attached naturally (Vye, unpublished results).

Localised nutrient enrichment was achieved by attaching nutrient diffusers (drilled 50 ml sample tubes) to each plate. Diffusers were filled with 140g of Everris Osmocote<sup>®</sup> Exact (Geldermalsen, Netherlands) slow release fertilizer pellets (11N:11P:18K) similar to previous studies (e.g., Hall et al., 2000; Minchinton and McKenzie, 2008; O'Connor and Donohue, 2013). Ambient treatments had diffusers filled with shell fragments to limit potential experimental artefacts. Analysis of water samples from within a 15 cm radius of experimental plates 8 weeks after the addition of fertiliser pellets using the same method indicated that nutrient enrichment was effective (ambient total oxidised nitrogen (mean  $\pm$  S.E.):  $10.54 \pm 0.81 \mu\text{m l}^{-1}$ , enriched total oxidised nitrogen:  $14.24 \pm 1.44 \mu\text{m l}^{-1}$ , ANOVA:  $F_{1, 14} = 5.014$ ,  $P = 0.042$ ).

The top surface of each plate was monitored every two to four weeks to ensure treatments were maintained and photographed at eight weeks and 24 weeks (Fig. 1). Abundance of all species on each plate was estimated from photos, as the new community was mono-layered and this method was more accurate than estimating percentage cover using grid quadrats and the point intercept method (Foster, 1991; Meese, 1992). During the experiment, the plates were colonised by the native barnacle, *S. balanoides*, and the non-native barnacle, *A. modestus*. A matrix of sediment and juvenile furoid ( $< 2\text{cm}$ ) was present on four out of the forty plates after twenty four weeks but these plates were distributed evenly among treatments and this was not considered in our analysis. Total abundance of all barnacles and abundance of each species were estimated using the Cell Counter plugin in ImageJ photo processing software (Schneider et al., 2012). At eight weeks, barnacle settlement had



occurred and cyprid larvae and recently metamorphosed juvenile barnacles were present on the plates. These were grouped under the term ‘settlers’ because it was not possible to distinguish between cyprid and juvenile barnacles accurately (Caffey, 1985; Jenkins et al., 1999; O’Riordan et al., 2004; Cruz et al., 2005; Power et al., 2006). It was also not possible to identify barnacles to species level at 8 weeks and, therefore, total barnacle abundance was used in analysis. At 24 weeks, barnacles were large enough to distinguish between species, allowing individual estimates of the abundance and mean size of *S. balanoides* and *A. modestus* per plate to be quantified. Estimates of percentage cover of each species relative to the free space available to them were used for the analysis. *S. balanoides* individuals were larger (mean  $\pm$  S.E.:  $19.13 \pm 0.95 \text{ mm}^2$ ) than *A. modestus* (mean  $\pm$  S.E.:  $15.40 \pm 0.79 \text{ mm}^2$ ) and thus occupied a greater area of space than *S. balanoides* even when species abundances were similar. Focussing on percentage cover of each species, rather than abundance, is therefore more meaningful when comparing benthic recruitment rates in communities where settling space is a limiting resource, such as rocky shore communities (Dayton, 1971). In addition, we tested whether barnacle density differed between oysters shell and experimental plates to assess whether preferential settlement on oysters occurred. An oyster was selected haphazardly from plates with *C. gigas* (from treatments with 4 & 8 individuals/ plate) and barnacle density on the oysters was estimated (individuals  $\text{cm}^{-1}$ ) and compared to barnacle density on the plates and was shown not to differ significantly ( $t = 1.279$ ,  $df = 18$ ,  $P = 0.216$ ).

### 2.3. Data analysis

Analysis of variance (ANOVA) was used to test all hypotheses with density of *C. gigas* (four levels) and nutrient enrichment (two levels) as fixed factors. Data were tested for assumptions of homogeneity of variances using Levene’s test and normality was examined using Q-Q plots and Shapiro-Wilk tests. Total abundance of settlers and recruits at 8 weeks and 24 weeks were log transformed. Percentage data were arcsine square root transformed (Sokal

and Rohlf, 1995). Student-Newman-Keuls tests were used to make *post-hoc* comparisons among levels of significant terms. All statistical analyses were carried out in R 2.15.3 (R Development Core Team, 2011).

### 3. Results

At eight weeks, there was no significant interaction between the presence of *C. gigas* and nutrient enrichment ( $F_{3,31} = 0.773$ ,  $P = 0.518$ , Fig. 2A) on the total abundance of settled barnacles on the experimental plates. The presence of *C. gigas* did not affect the total abundance of settled barnacles on the experimental plates significantly even at the greatest oyster density level ( $F_{3,31} = 1.348$ ,  $P = 0.277$ , Fig. 2A). There was no significant effect of nutrient enrichment on the total abundance of settled barnacles ( $F_{1,31} = 0.228$ ,  $P = 0.636$ ; Fig. 2A). At 24 weeks, there was no significant interaction between the presence of *C. gigas* and nutrient enrichment ( $F_{3,31} = 1.719$ ,  $P = 0.183$ , Fig. 2B) on total barnacle abundance. There was a significantly greater total abundance of barnacles on settlement plates where *C. gigas* was absent compared to all treatments with *C. gigas*, regardless of oyster density ( $F_{3,31} = 3.279$ ,  $P = 0.034$ , Fig. 2B and Fig. 2B(i)). However, there was no significant effect of nutrient enrichment on total barnacle abundance ( $F_{1,31} = 2.104$ ,  $P = 0.183$ , Fig. 2B).

At 24 weeks, when barnacle species could be distinguished, the native *S. balanoides* constituted  $26 \pm 2$  % (mean  $\pm$  S.E.) of the total abundance of barnacles with the remaining  $74 \pm 2$  % (mean  $\pm$  S.E.) comprised of the smaller invasive barnacle *A. modestus* across all treatments. Mean total percentage cover of barnacles on the plates was  $15.1 \pm 2.4$  % ( $\pm$  S.E.). There was no significant interaction between the presence of *C. gigas* and nutrient enrichment ( $F_{3,31} = 0.793$ ,  $P = 0.507$ , Fig. 3A) on the percentage cover of *S. balanoides*. There was also no significant effect of the presence of *C. gigas* ( $F_{3,31} = 1.030$ ,  $P = 0.393$ , Fig. 3A), nor of nutrient enrichment ( $F_{1,31} = 0.059$ ,  $P = 0.810$ , Fig. 3A) on percentage cover

of *S. balanoides*. There was no significant interaction between the presence of *C. gigas* and nutrient enrichment ( $F_{3,31} = 2.082$ ,  $P = 0.123$ ) on the percentage cover of the invasive barnacle *A. modestus*. Both the presence of *C. gigas* ( $F_{3,31} = 3.329$ ,  $P = 0.032$ , Fig. 3B and 3B (i)) and nutrient enrichment ( $F_{1,31} = 4.374$ ,  $P = 0.045$ , Fig. 3B and 3B (ii)) had significant negative effects on the percentage cover of *A. modestus*, however, there was no significant effect of increasing densities of *C. gigas* (Fig. 3B (i)).

#### 4. Discussion

This study tested empirically for effects of invasive species, coupled with nutrient enrichment, on the early life history processes of two species of barnacle and identified negative effects of an invasive species and nutrient enrichment on invasive barnacle recruitment. The effects of both factors on barnacle recruitment were independent of each other indicating that the cumulative effect of both *C. gigas* presence and nutrient enrichment were additive. These effects on barnacle recruitment, however, were not consistent across both species, affecting an invasive but not a native species. Recruitment of the invasive barnacle, *Austrominius modestus*, was lower in the presence of the invasive oyster, *Crassostrea gigas*, whereas recruitment of the native species, *Semibalanus balanoides* was not affected by either stressor. Furthermore, increasing the density of *C. gigas* did not enhance their negative effect on recruitment of *A. modestus*, indicating that this effect was not density-dependent, which shows that even at low densities the presence of an invasive species can determine subsequent community dynamics. These findings also show that the effects of an invasive species on other benthic species recruitment varies between different species of recruits and are not determined necessarily by the presence of a secondary stressor, such as nutrient enrichment, or the density of the invasive species.

230 The negative effect of the presence of *C. gigas* on recruitment of the invader *A. modestus*  
231 may have been driven by reduced settlement or increased post-settlement mortality rates.  
232 Differential settlement may have occurred, where all the settlers at 8 weeks, which could not  
233 be identified to species level, were the native barnacle, *S. balanoides*. *Semibalanus*  
234 *balanoides* showed no response to *C. gigas* or nutrient enrichment treatments at 24 weeks,  
235 indicating that *S. balanoides* settlement and recruitment may not be affected by these  
236 treatments. Hence, the effects seen at 24 weeks may have been a result of the subsequent  
237 reduced settlement and recruitment of *A. modestus* between the two sampling events.  
238 Differential settlement may occur where there are inter-species differences in larval supply or  
239 settlement cues (Bohn et al., 2013). Alternatively, if differential settlement did not occur,  
240 treatment effects could have been on post-settlement mortality rather than reduced settlement  
241 because the effects were detected only at 24 weeks. It is possible that there was a density-  
242 dependent reduction in settlers after eight weeks, as the presence of *C. gigas* reduced the free  
243 space available for settlement. This is not probable, however, because of the known  
244 gregarious behaviour of barnacles (Barnett and Crisp, 1979) and the relatively large amount  
245 of free space (approximately 60%) remaining on the experimental plates. The similar density  
246 of barnacles on settlement plates compared to *C. gigas* shells also indicates that no  
247 preferential settlement occurred on the oysters that may have confounded any effects of *C.*  
248 *gigas* on settlement. These findings suggest that effects of the presence of the invasive oyster  
249 could have manifested at post-settlement mortality stages. Post-settlement mortality is a key  
250 determinant of population dynamics in barnacles and, thus, the effects of *C. gigas* and  
251 nutrient enrichment on barnacle early life history may propagate through time to impact the  
252 diversity and functioning of mature benthic communities (Hunt and Scheibling, 1997; Delany  
253 et al., 2003).

254 The lower total barnacle recruitment rate, primarily a result of fewer *A. modestus*, may have  
255 been caused by a range of mechanisms. According to optimal foraging theory (MacArthur  
256 and Pianka, 1966), the addition of *C. gigas* may represent an increase in prey resource (Pyke,  
257 1984) for consumer species, such as the common shore crab *Carcinus maenas*, that may prey  
258 upon both juvenile oysters and barnacles (Diederich, 2005). This may lead to enhanced  
259 predation levels on the settlement plates. Alternatively, the physical presence of *C. gigas* may  
260 have led to increased turbulence around the plate, increasing mortality directly owing to  
261 physical disturbance (Crimaldi et al., 2002; Gutierrez et al., 2003). In addition, *C. gigas* could  
262 affect mortality indirectly by mechanisms including filter feeding, which would reduce food  
263 supply, and by causing differences in biofilm composition by altering hydrology (Thompson  
264 et al., 2005; Neal and Yule, 2009). In each of these potential mechanisms, a density-  
265 dependent effect of *C. gigas* may have been expected, however, we did not identify any  
266 density-dependence in this study. This may have been because *C. gigas* covered only  
267 approximately 45% of each plate at the highest density, which may have not been sufficient  
268 for density effects on recruitment to become apparent (Wagner et al., 2012; Wilkie et al.,  
269 2013). It has been hypothesised that the presence of invasive species may affect the  
270 recruitment of other non-native species, either by increasing non-native species recruitment  
271 under the invasional meltdown hypothesis (Simberloff and Holle, 1999), or by reducing non-  
272 native species recruitment by increasing community invasion resistance (Elton, 1958;  
273 Balmford, 1996; Levine and D'Antonio, 1999). Our results show that the recruitment rate of  
274 the non-native barnacle, *A. modestus* was lower when *C. gigas* was present, which is not  
275 consistent with the invasional meltdown hypothesis. Invasional meltdown occurs when there  
276 are facilitative direct or indirect interspecific interactions amongst invasive species  
277 (Simberloff and Holle, 1999), suggesting that in this study there were no facilitative  
278 interactions between *A. modestus* and *C. gigas*.

279 Nutrient enrichment also decreased the percentage cover of *A. modestus*, which again was  
 280 probably driven by increasing post-settlement mortality. Direct effects of nutrient enrichment  
 281 on post-settlement mortality of *A. modestus* may have been caused by increases in ammonia  
 282 concentrations within nutrient enriched treatments, which has been shown previously to  
 283 affect recruitment in benthic invertebrates (Fitt and Coon, 1992), or as a result of other  
 284 compounds, such as potassium (Kang et al., 2004), incidentally released in nutrient enriched  
 285 treatments (Pawlik and Hadfield, 1990; Pawlik, 1992; Minchinton and McKenzie, 2008).  
 286 Nutrient enrichment may also have reduced recruitment by causing differences in the  
 287 abundance and composition of biofilm, an important food resource for intertidal grazers  
 288 (Jenkins et al., 2001; Hill and Hawkins, 2009), and therefore, increased grazing rates on the  
 289 settlement plates (Thompson et al., 2000). Grazing activity by the limpet, *Patella vulgata*  
 290 (Lewis, 1954) and the periwinkle *Littorina littorea* (Connell, 1961a; Dayton, 1971), both  
 291 present at the study site, have been linked to increased biological disturbance and, thus,  
 292 increased post-settlement mortality of newly settled cyprid larvae and juvenile barnacles  
 293 (Lewis, 1954; Connell, 1961b; Dayton, 1971; O'Connor et al., 2011). Our results are contrary  
 294 to studies in other systems that have found nutrient enrichment to increase invasion (Bertocci  
 295 et al., 2015; Gennaro and Piazzzi, 2011), suggesting the impacts of nutrient enrichment on  
 296 invasive species are likely determined by the main life-history traits of the species examined.  
 297 Despite the predicted widespread occurrence of synergistic and antagonistic cumulative  
 298 impacts of multiple stressors (Sala and Knowlton, 2006; Crain et al., 2008), this study found  
 299 only additive cumulative effects of the presence of *C. gigas* and nutrient enrichment on *A.*  
 300 *modestus* recruitment. Additive effects are estimated to occur in approximately 25% of  
 301 multiple stressor scenarios (Crain et al., 2008) and may allow greater predictability of  
 302 cumulative effects where there is sufficient information describing the direct effects (e.g.  
 303 Chiu et al., 2008; Rius et al., 2009). The additive cumulative effects were identified over a

relatively short time period in this study, however, the nature of the interaction among stressors may shift over longer time periods as the effects of the stressors develop (Darling and Côté, 2008). In light of this, continued environmental change, such as ocean warming and changes in climate variability, during community development over a longer time scale may lead to more indirect and unpredictable impacts on communities and their functioning (Crain et al., 2008).

We have shown that the additive cumulative effects of species invasion and nutrient enrichment differed between recruiting species and, thus, have potential consequences for population dynamics and the assemblage structure of mature communities. This study highlights the importance of considering the effects of invasion, in combination with other anthropogenic stressors, on processes and events across a range of life history stages in order to fully comprehend multiple stressor impacts on communities. Future work should focus on determining the mechanisms causing the individual and cumulative effects of invasion and nutrient enrichment on recruitment using natural substrata, more complex communities and over longer time periods. We should aim to identify the specific contexts at different life history stages that determine interactions among multiple stressors in order to advance our understanding of multiple stressor impacts.

## **Acknowledgements**

This study was completed as part of a PhD funded by the Department for Employment and Learning, Northern Ireland. The authors thank Dr Florin Rusu of PKB Oysters for donating the oyster spat, Dr Brian Stewart of the Agri-Food and Biosciences Institute for nutrient analysis, and two anonymous reviewers whose comments greatly improved this manuscript.

## **References**

327 Aguilera, M.A., Navarrete, S.A., 2012. Functional identity and functional structure change  
 328 through succession in a rocky intertidal marine herbivore assemblage. *Ecology* 93, 75–89.

329 Balch, T., Scheibling, R., 2000. Temporal and spatial variability in settlement and  
 330 recruitment of echinoderms in kelp beds and barrens in Nova Scotia. *Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser.*  
 331 205, 139–154.

332 Balmford, A., 1996. Extinction filters and current resilience: the significance of past selection  
 333 pressures for conservation biology. *Trends. Ecol. Evol.* 11, 193–196.

334 Barnett, B.E., Crisp, D.J., 1979. Laboratory studies of gregarious settlement in *Balanus*  
 335 *balanoides* and *Elminius modestus* in relation to competition between these species. *J. Mar.*  
 336 *Biol. Assoc. UK* 59, 581–590.

337 Bertocci, I., Godino, J.D., Freitas, C., Incera, M., Araújo, R., Bio, A., Arenas, F., Sousa-  
 338 Pinto, I., Reis, P.A., Domínguez, R., 2015. The regime of climate-related disturbance and  
 339 nutrient enrichment modulate macroalgal invasions in rockpools. *Biol. Invasions.* 17, 133–  
 340 147.

341 Bishop, M., 1947. Establishment of an immigrant barnacle in British coastal waters. *Nature*  
 342 159, 501–502.

343 Bohn, K., Richardson, C.A., Jenkins, S.R., 2013. The importance of larval supply, larval  
 344 habitat selection and post-settlement mortality in determining intertidal adult abundance of  
 345 the invasive gastropod *Crepidula fornicata*. *J. Exp. Mar. Bio. Ecol.* 440, 132–140.

346 Bradley, C., Byrne, C., Craig, M., Free, G., Gallagher, T., Kennedy, B., Little, R., Lucey, J.,  
 347 Mannix, A., McCreesh, P., McDermott, G., McGarrigle, M., Ní Longphuirt, S., O’Boyle, S.,



348 Plant, C., Tierney, D., Trodd, W., Webster, P., Wilkes, R., Wynne, C., 2015. Water Quality in  
349 Ireland 2010 – 2012.

350 Caffey, H., 1985. Spatial and temporal variation in settlement and recruitment of intertidal  
351 barnacles. *Ecol. Monogr.* 55, 313–332.

352 Canning-Clode, J., Kaufmann, M., Molis, M., Wahl, M., Lenz, M., 2008. Influence of  
353 disturbance and nutrient enrichment on early successional fouling communities in an  
354 oligotrophic marine system. *Mar. Ecol.* 29, 115–124.

355 Chiu, J., Zhang, R., Wang, H., Thiagarajan, V., Qian, P., 2008. Nutrient effects on intertidal  
356 community: from bacteria to invertebrates. *Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser.* 358, 41–50.

357 Connell, J.H., 1961a. The influence of interspecific competition and other factors on the  
358 distribution of the barnacle *Chthamalus stellatus*. *Ecology* 42, 710–723.

359 Connell, J.H., 1961b. Effects of competition, predation by *Thais lapillus* and other factors  
360 on natural populations of the barnacle *Balanus balanoides*. *Ecol. Monogr.* 31, 61–104.

361 Connell, J.H., 1985. The consequences of variation in initial settlement vs. post-settlement  
362 mortality in rocky intertidal communities. *J. Exp. Mar. Bio. Ecol.* 93, 11–45.

363 Crain, C.M., Kroeker, K., Halpern, B.S., 2008. Interactive and cumulative effects of multiple  
364 human stressors in marine systems. *Ecol. Lett.* 11, 1304–1315.

365 Crimaldi, J.P., Thompson, J.K., Rosman, J.H., Lowe, R.J., Koseff, J.R., 2002.  
366 Hydrodynamics of larval settlement: The influence of turbulent stress events at potential  
367 recruitment sites. *Limnol. Oceanogr.* 47, 1137–1151.

368 Crisp, D.J., 1958. The spread of *Elminius modestus* Darwin in north-west Europe. J. Mar.  
369 Biol. Assoc. UK 37, 483.

370 Cruz, T., Castro, J.J., Delany, J., McGrath, D., Myers, A.A., O'Riordan, R.M., Power, A-M.,  
371 Rabaça, J., Hawkins, S.J., 2005. Tidal rates of settlement of the intertidal barnacles  
372 *Chthamalus stellatus* and *Chthamalus montagui* in western Europe: the influence of the  
373 night/day cycle. J. Exp. Mar. Bio. Ecol. 318, 51–60.

374 Darling, E.S., Côté, I.M., 2008. Quantifying the evidence for ecological synergies. Ecol. Lett.  
375 11, 1278–86.

376 Dayton, P., 1971. Competition , disturbance , and community organization : the provision and  
377 subsequent utilization of space in a rocky intertidal community. Ecol. Monogr. 41, 351–389.

378 Delany, J., Myers, A., McGrath, D., O'Riordan, R.M., Power, A-M., 2003. Role of post-  
379 settlement mortality and “supply-side” ecology in setting patterns of intertidal distribution in  
380 the chthamalid barnacles *Chthamalus montagui* and *C. stellatus*. Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser. 249,  
381 207–214.

382 Diederich, S., 2005. Differential recruitment of introduced Pacific oysters and native mussels  
383 at the North Sea coast: coexistence possible? J. Sea Res. 53, 269–281.

384 Dzialowski, A.R., Jessie, W., 2009. Zebra mussels negate or mask the increasing effects of  
385 nutrient enrichment on algal biomass: a preliminary mesocosm study. J. Plankton. Res. 31,  
386 1437–1440.

387 Elton, C.S., 1958. The ecology of invasions by animals and plants. Springer US, New York.

388 Fitt, W.K., Coon, S.L., 1992. Evidence for ammonia as a natural cue for recruitment of oyster  
389 larvae to oyster beds in a Georgia salt marsh. Biol. Bull. 182, 401–408.

390 Folt, C.L., Chen, C.Y., Moore, M.V., Burnaford, J., 1999. Synergism and antagonism among  
 391 multiple stressors. *Limnol. Oceanogr.* 44, 864–877.

392 Gaines, S., Roughgarden, J., 1985. Larval settlement rate: A leading determinant of structure  
 393 in an ecological community of the marine intertidal zone. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* 82,  
 394 3707–11.

395 Gennaro, P., Piazzzi, L., 2011. Synergism between two anthropic impacts: *Caulerpa racemosa*  
 396 var. *cylindracea* invasion and seawater nutrient enrichment. *Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser.* 427, 59–  
 397 70.

398 Gosselin, L.A., Qian, P., 1997. Juvenile mortality in benthic marine invertebrates. *Mar. Ecol.*  
 399 *Ser.* 146, 265–282.

400 Gosselin, L.A., Qian, P., 1996. Early post-settlement mortality of an intertidal barnacle : a  
 401 critical period for survival. *Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser.* 13, 69–75.

402 Green, D.S., Boots, B., Crowe, T.P., 2012. Effects of non-indigenous oysters on microbial  
 403 diversity and ecosystem functioning. *PLoS One* 7:e48410.

404 Green, D.S., Crowe, T.P., 2013. Physical and biological effects of introduced oysters on  
 405 biodiversity in an intertidal boulder field. *Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser.*, 482, 119–132.

406 Green, D.S., Crowe, T.P., 2014. Context- and density-dependent effects of introduced oysters  
 407 on biodiversity. *Biol. Invasions* 16, 1145–1163.

408 Guo, X., Allen, S.K., 1994. Reproductive potential and genetics of triploid oysters,  
 409 *Crassostrea gigas* (Thunberg). *Biol. Bull.* 187, 309–318.

410 Gutierrez, J.L., Jones, C.G., Strayer, D.L., Iribarne, O.O., 2003. Mollusks as ecosystem  
 411 engineers: the role of shell production in aquatic habitats. *Oikos* 101, 79–90.

412 Hall, S.J., Gray, S.A., Hammett, Z.L., 2000. Biodiversity-productivity relations: an  
 413 experimental evaluation of mechanisms. *Oecologia* 122, 545–555.

414 Hill, A.S., Hawkins, S.J., 2009. Seasonal and spatial variation of epilithic micro algal  
 415 distribution and abundance and its ingestion by *Patella vulgata* on a moderately exposed  
 416 rocky shore. *J. Mar. Biol. Assoc. UK* 71, 403.

417 Hughes, A.T.P., Baird, A.H., Dinsdale, E.A., Moltschaniwsky, N.A., Pratchett, M.S., Tanner,  
 418 E., Willis, B.L., 2000. Supply-side ecology works both ways: the link between benthic adults,  
 419 fecundity, and larval recruits. *Ecology* 81, 2241–2249.

420 Hunt, H.L., Scheibling, R.E., 1997. Role of early post-settlement mortality in recruitment of  
 421 benthic marine invertebrates. *Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser.* 155, 269–301.

422 Jara, V.C., Miyamoto, J.H.S., da Gama, B.A.P., Molis, M., Wahl, M., Pereira, R.C., 2006.  
 423 Limited evidence of interactive disturbance and nutrient effects on the diversity of  
 424 macrobenthic assemblages. *Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser.* 308, 37–48.

425 Jenkins, S.R., 2005. Larval habitat selection, not larval supply, determines settlement patterns  
 426 and adult distribution in two chthamalid barnacles. *J. Anim. Ecol.* 74, 893–904.

427 Jenkins, S.R., Arenas, F., Arrontes, J., Bussell, J., Castro, J., Coleman, R.A., Hawkins, S.J.,  
 428 Kay, S., Martínez, B., Oliveros, J., Roberts, M.F., Sousa, S., Thompson, R.C., Hartnoll, R.G.,  
 429 2001. European-scale analysis of seasonal variability in limpet grazing activity and  
 430 microalgal abundance. *Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser.* 211, 193–203.

431 Jenkins, S.R., Norton, T.A., Hawkins, S.J., 1999. Settlement and post-settlement interactions  
 432 between *Semibalanus balanoides* (L.) (Crustacea: Cirripedia) and three species of fucoid  
 433 canopy algae. J. Exp. Mar. Bio. Ecol. 236, 49–67.

434 Kang, K.H., Kim, B.H., Kim, J.M., 2004. Induction of larval settlement and metamorphosis  
 435 of the abalone, *Haliotis discus hannai* larvae using bromomethane and potassium chloride.  
 436 Aquaculture 230, 249–259.

437 Kochmann, J., Buschbaum, C., Volkenborn, N., Reise, K., 2008. Shift from native mussels to  
 438 alien oysters: Differential effects of ecosystem engineers. J. Exp. Mar. Bio. Ecol. 364, 1–10.

439 Lathlean, J., Minchinton, T., 2012. Manipulating thermal stress on rocky shores to predict  
 440 patterns of recruitment of marine invertebrates under a changing climate. Mar. Ecol. Prog.  
 441 Ser. 467, 121–136.

442 Lawson, J., Davenport, J., Whitaker, A., 2004. Barnacle distribution in Lough Hyne Marine  
 443 Nature Reserve: a new baseline and an account of invasion by the introduced Australasian  
 444 species *Elminius modestus* Darwin. Estuar. Coast. Shelf Sci. 60, 729–735.

445 Levine, J.M., D’Antonio, C.M., 1999. Elton revisited: a review of evidence linking diversity  
 446 and invasibility. Oikos 87, 15–26.

447 Lewis, J.R., 1954. Observations on a high-level population of limpets. J. Anim. Ecol. 23, 85–  
 448 100.

449 Lotze, H.K., Lenihan, H.S., Bourque, B.J., Bradbury, R.H., Cooke, R.G., Kay, M.C.,  
 450 Kidwell, S.M., Kirby, M.X., Peterson, C.H., Jackson, J.B.C., 2006. Depletion, degradation,  
 451 and recovery potential of estuaries and coastal seas. Science 312, 1806–1809.

452 MacArthur, R.H., Pianka, E.R., 1966. On optimal use of a patchy environment. *Am. Nat.*  
 453 100, 603–609.

454 Menge, B.A., Sutherland, W.J., 1987. Community regulation: variation in disturbance,  
 455 competition and predation in relation to environmental stress and recruitment. *Am. Nat.* 130,  
 456 730–757.

457 Minchinton, T.E., McKenzie, L.A., 2008. Nutrient enrichment affects recruitment of oysters  
 458 and barnacles in a mangrove forest. *Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser.* 354, 181–189.

459 Neal, A.L., Yule, A.B., 2009. The tenacity of *Elminius modestus* and *Balanus perforatus*  
 460 cyprids to bacterial films grown under different shear regimes. *J. Mar. Biol. Assoc. UK* 74,  
 461 251–257.

462 O'Connor, N.E. & Donohue, I., 2013. Environmental context determines multi-trophic  
 463 effects of consumer species loss. *Glob. Change. Biol.* 19, 431–40.

464 O'Connor, N.E., Donohue, I., Crowe, T.P., Emmerson, M.C., 2011. Importance of consumers  
 465 on exposed and sheltered rocky shores. *Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser.* 443, 65–75.

466 O'Riordan, R.M., Arenas, F., Arrontes, J., Castro, J.J., Cruz, T., Delany, J., Martínez, B.,  
 467 Fernandez, C., Hawkins, S.J., McGrath, D., Myers, A.A., Oliveros, J., Pannacciulli, F.G.,  
 468 Power, A-M., Relini, G., Rico, J.M., Silva, T., 2004. Spatial variation in the recruitment of  
 469 the intertidal barnacles *Chthamalus montagui* Southward and *Chthamalus stellatus* (Poli)  
 470 (Crustacea: Cirripedia) over an European scale. *J. Exp. Mar. Bio. Ecol.* 304, 243–264.

471 Padilla, D.K., 2010. Context-dependent impacts of a non-native ecosystem engineer, the  
 472 Pacific oyster *Crassostrea gigas*. *Integr. Comp. Biol.* 50, 213–225.

473 Pawlik, J.R., 1992. Chemical ecology of the settlement of benthic marine invertebrates.  
 474 Oceanogr. Mar. Biol. Annu. Rev. 30, 273–335.

475 Pawlik, J.R., Hadfield, M.G., 1990. A symposium on chemical factors that influence the  
 476 settlement and metamorphosis of marine invertebrate larvae: introduction and perspective.  
 477 Bull. Mar. Sci. 46, 450–454.

478 Piazzzi, L., Balata, D., Ceccherelli, G., Cinelli, F., 2005. Interactive effect of sedimentation  
 479 and *Caulerpa racemosa* var. *cylindracea* invasion on macroalgal assemblages in the  
 480 Mediterranean Sea. Estuar. Coast. Shelf. Sci., 64, 467–474.

481 Power, A-M., Delany, J., McGrath, D., Myers, A.A., O'Riordan, R.M., 2006. Patterns of adult  
 482 abundance in *Chthamalus stellatus* (Poli) and *C. montagui* Southward (Crustacea: Cirripedia)  
 483 emerge during late recruitment. J. Exp. Mar. Bio. Ecol. 332, 151–165.

484 Pyke, G.H., 1984. Optimal foraging theory : a critical review. Annu. Rev. Ecol. Syst. 15,  
 485 523–575.

486 Queiros, A. de M., Hiddink, J.G., Johnson, G., Cabral, H.N., Kaiser, M.J., 2011. Context  
 487 dependence of marine ecosystem engineer invasion impacts on benthic ecosystem  
 488 functioning. Biol. Invasions. 13, 1059–1075.

489 R Development Core Team, 2011. R: a language and environment for statistical computing.  
 490 R Found Stat Comput 1, 409.

491 Rius, M., Turon, X., Marshall, D.J., 2009. Non-lethal effects of an invasive species in the  
 492 marine environment: the importance of early life-history stages. Oecologia 159, 873–82.

493 Rodriguez, S.R., Ojedal, F.P., Inestrosa, N.C., 1993. Settlement of benthic marine  
 494 invertebrates. Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser. 97, 193–207.

495 Ruesink, J.L., Lenihan, H.S., Trimble, A.C., Heiman, K.W., Micheli, F., Byers, J.E., Kay,  
 496 M.C., 2005. Introduction of non-native oysters: ecosystem effects and restoration  
 497 implications. *Annu. Rev. Ecol. Evol. Syst.* 36, 643–689.

498 Sala, E., Knowlton, N., 2006. Global marine biodiversity trends. *Annu. Rev. Environ.*  
 499 *Resour.* 31, 93–122.

500 Schneider, C.A., Rasband, W.S., Eliceiri, K.W., 2012. NIH Image to ImageJ: 25 years of  
 501 image analysis. *Nat. Methods.* 9, 671–675.

502 Simberloff, D., Holle, B.Von, 1999. Positive interactions of nonindigenous species :  
 503 invasional meltdown? *Biol. Invasions* 1, 21–32.

504 Sokal, R.R., Rohlf, F.J., 1995. *Biometry: the principles and practice of statistics in biological*  
 505 *research.* New York.

506 Stachowicz, J.J., Fried, H., Osman, R.W., Whitlatch, R.B., 2002. Biodiversity, invasion  
 507 resistance, and marine ecosystem function: Reconciling pattern and process. *Ecology* 83,  
 508 2575–2590.

509 Strathmann, R.R., Branscomb, E.S., Vedder, K., 1981. Fatal errors in set as a cost of dispersal  
 510 and the influence of intertidal flora on set of barnacles. *Oecologia* 48, 13–18.

511 Strayer, D.L., 2012. Eight questions about invasions and ecosystem functioning. *Ecol. Lett.*  
 512 15, 1199–1210.

513 Sutherland, W.J., Adams, W.M., Aronson, R.B., Aveling, R., Blackburn, T.M., Broad, S.,  
 514 Ceballos, G., Côté, I.M., Cowling, R.M., Da Fonseca, G.A.B., Dinerstein, E., Ferraro, P.J.,  
 515 Fleishman, E., Gascon, C., Hunter, M., Hutton, J., Kareiva, P., Kuria, A., Macdonald, D.W.,  
 516 Mackinnon, K., Madgwick, F.J., Mascia, M.B., McNeely, J., Milner-Gulland, E.J., Moon, S.,



517 Morley, C.G., Nelson, S., Osborn, D., Pai, M., Parsons, E.C.M., Peck, L.S., Possingham, H.,  
 518 Prior, S.V., Pullin, A.S., Rands, M.R.W., Ranganathan, J., Redford, K.H., Rodriguez, J.P.,  
 519 Seymour, F., Sobel, J., Sodhi, N.S., Stott, A., Vance-Borland, K., Watkinson, A.R., 2009.  
 520 One hundred questions of importance to the conservation of global biological diversity.  
 521 *Conserv. Biol.* 23, 557–67.

522 Thompson, R., Moschella, P., Jenkins, S., Norton, T.A., Hawkins, S.J., 2005. Differences in  
 523 photosynthetic marine biofilms between sheltered and moderately exposed rocky shores.  
 524 *Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser.* 296, 53–63.

525 Thompson, R.C., Roberts, M.F., Norton, T.A. & Hawkins, S.J., 2000. Feast or famine for  
 526 intertidal grazing molluscs: a mis-match between seasonal variations in grazing intensity and  
 527 the abundance of microbial resources. *Hydrobiologia* 440, 357–367.

528 Vaz-Pinto, F., Olabarria, C., Arenas, F., 2013. Role of top-down and bottom-up forces on the  
 529 invasibility of intertidal macroalgal assemblages. *J. Sea. Res.* 76, 178–186.

530 Vye, S.R., Emmerson, M.C., Arenas, F., Dick, J.T.A., O'Connor, N.E., 2015. Stressor  
 531 intensity determines antagonistic interactions between species invasion and multiple stressor  
 532 effects on ecosystem functioning. *Oikos* 124, 1005–1012.

533 Wagner, E., Dumbauld, B., Hacker, S., Trimble, A.C., Wisehart, L.M., Ruesink, J.L., 2012.  
 534 Density-dependent effects of an introduced oyster, *Crassostrea gigas*, on a native intertidal  
 535 seagrass, *Zostera marina*. *Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser.* 468, 149–160.

536 Wahle, R.A., Incze, L.S., 1997. Pre- and post-settlement processes in recruitment of the  
 537 American lobster. *J. Exp. Mar. Bio. Ecol.* 217, 179–207.

538 Wilkie, E.M., Bishop, M.J., O'Connor, W.A., 2013. The density and spatial arrangement of  
539 the invasive oyster *Crassostrea gigas* determines its impact on settlement of native oyster  
540 larvae. Ecol. Evol. 3, 4851–60.

541 Wilkie, E.M., Bishop, M.J., O'Connor, W.A., 2012. Are native *Saccostrea glomerata* and  
542 invasive *Crassostrea gigas* oysters' habitat equivalents for epibenthic communities in south-  
543 eastern Australia? J. Exp. Mar. Bio. Ecol. 420-421, 16–25.

544 Yokomizo, H., Possingham, H.P., Thomas, M.B., Buckley, Y.M., 2009. Managing the impact  
545 of invasive species : the value of knowing the density-impact curve. Ecology 19, 376–386.

546

547 **Figure legends**

548 Fig. 1: Experimental plate showing settlement and recruitment of barnacles after 24 weeks.

549 Fig. 2: Mean abundance of barnacle settlers ( $\pm$  S.E.) per plate ( $31.1 \text{ cm}^2$ ) with absence and  
550 increasing densities of *C. gigas* at eight weeks (A) and 24 weeks (B). Open bars represent  
551 ambient nutrient treatments and closed bars are enriched nutrient treatments. Fig. 2B (i)  
552 means of *C. gigas* density treatments across ambient and nutrient enriched conditions based  
553 on SNK tests. Significant differences among means are indicated by different lower case  
554 letters ( $P < 0.05$ ).

555 Fig. 3: Mean percentage cover ( $\pm$  S.E.) of *S. balanoides* (A) and *A. modestus* (B), at 24  
556 weeks. Fig. 3B (i) means of *C. gigas* treatments across ambient and nutrient enriched  
557 conditions and Fig. 3B (ii) means of nutrient enrichment treatments across *C. gigas*  
558 treatments. Open bars and 'A' represent ambient treatments and closed bars and 'N+'  
559 represent nutrient enriched treatments. Significant differences among treatments or levels of  
560 treatments are indicated by lower case letters ( $P < 0.05$ ).